





Employability of Graduate Students with Disability in Ethiopia

Department of Special Needs Education College of Education and Behavioral Studies Addis Ababa University Addis Ababa, Ethiopia July 2013

Employability of Graduate Students with Disability in Ethiopia

Local Research Team

Tirussew Teferra, (Professor), Project Leader
Alemayehu Teklemariam (PhD), Belay Hagos (PhD)
Fantahun Admas (PhD), Moges Abey (PhD)
Sewalem Tesga(PhD), Tilahun Achaw, PhD and
Yirgashewa Bekele, PhD

Department of Special Needs Education Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia July 2013

Preface

The study on the "Employability of Graduate Students with Disability in Ethiopia" is a sub-project of the "Responding to Poverty and Disability through Higher Education and Research (RESPOND-HER). The other ongoing sub-project is entitled "The Creation of Inclusive Environment in Institutions of Higher Education in Ethiopia". They are all financed by the Austrian Development Cooperation and the contract is signed between the Austrian Agency for International Cooperation and Research (OeAD) and the University. We have been closely working in consultation with Professor Dr. Gottfried Biewer of the University of Vienna and his Research Team from the research design to the final stage of this study. Indeed, the RESPOND-HER is a joint collaborative project between Addis Ababa University and University of Vienna.

The Local Research Team Member would like to seize this opportunity to acknowledge the professional input and the commitment the Vienna Research Team has thus far demonstrated to get the project in motion and realize its objectives.

Tirussew Teferra, Professor Local Project Leader Addis Ababa July, 2013

Table of contents

	Page
1. Introduction	1
1.1. Background	1
1.2. Research Problem	2
1.3. Research Objective	2
1.4. Significance of the Study	2
2 Method of Research	2
2.1. Study sites and organizations covered by the study	2
2.2. Participants of the study	3
2.3. Tools of data collection	4
2.4. Procedures of data collection	4
2.5. Data analysis	4
3. Literature Review	4
3.1 Legislation and Employments Status Persons with Disability	4
3.2 Employment Process and Work Environment	4
3.3 Employment is Attitude Toward PwDs	7
4 Results	8
4.1. Employment condition of Graduates with Disabilities	8
4.1.1. Background	15
4.1.2. Employment conditions	15
4.1.2.1. Current employment status	16
4.1.2.2. Employment Stories	19
4.1.2.3. Working Environment	26
4.2. Employers	26
4.2.1. Process and Procedures of Employmet GOs and NGOs	29
4.2.2. Working Environment	29
4.2.3. Significants to Imporove the Employment Conditions	30
4.3. National Associations of Persons with Disabilities	33
4.3.1. Employment Status of of PwDs	35
4.3.2. Major Factors Affecting the Employment of PwDs	35
4.3.3. Working conditions	35

	4.3.4. Intervensions for the improvement of the Employability PwDs	36
	4.4. University Students with Disabilities	38
	4.4.1. Support and accommodation	41
	4.4.2. Challenges	45
	4.4.3. Hopes and worries of employment	
5	Challenges, opportunities and reflections on the way forward	43
	5.1. Challenges	43
	5.2. Opportunities	43
	5.3. Reflections	44
6	Conclusion and Recommendations	44
	6.1. Conclusion	44
	6.2. Major Recommendation	45
Re	eference	46
Aı	nnexes	48

1 Introduction

1.1 Background

In Ethiopia graduates with disabilities tend to face serious barriers in the labor market and a risk of unemployment. There are fragmented evidences showing that university graduates with hearing, motor and visual disabilities do not have equal access to jobs, despite having the required qualifications due to attitudinal and other related factors. The situation seems even worse to female graduates with disabilities than male graduates with disabilities.

This study systematically explores the nature and extent of employment barriers and reflects the way forward to improve the employability of graduates with disabilities. The study attempts to investigate issues surrounding persons with disabilities such as the condition of their education or training, the process and procedures of employment, the nature of challenges and, opportunities, of employment and conditions of their working environment. Furthermore, the study identifies areas of intervention to improve the employability of persons with disabilities in the country.

The study is conducted in five selected study sites which include Addis Ababa, Adama, Bahirdar, Hawasa and Mekelle. The participants are university-bound graduating students with disability, university graduates with disability, employers of GOs and NGOs and private organizations and representatives of national associations of persons with disabilities.

1.2 Research problem

According to WHO estimation, about 10% of people with disabilities are living in developing countries including Ethiopia. These citizens are excluded from most walks of life in all sectors including employment and education. Misconceptions about disabilities combined with lack of knowledge about the potentials of persons with disabilities has contributed a lot to the limitation of this employment opportunities (Tirussew, 2005), and women with disabilities are at a further disadvantage because of gender role stereotyping which leads to double discrimination.

The study is envisaged to examine the state of employability of university graduates with disability in Ethiopia, which may serve as a knowledge-base for further intervention and research to improve the present state of affairs in the country.

1.3 Research Objective

General Objective

Assessing the employability of university graduates with disability and improve their access to the labor market of the country, thereby contributing to the poverty reduction strategy of the government of Ethiopia.

Specific objectives

- Explore the type of support and guidance provided for graduating university students with disabilities in different universities,
- Identify challenges and opportunities of employment for graduate students with disabilities in the country,
- Assess the conditions of working environment and benefits of employees with disability, and
- Develop strategies for improving accessibility and equal opportunities in the employment of graduates with disability.

1.4 Significance of the study

The study has implications on the effectiveness and efficiency of human capital development and utilization in the country. Above all, this is a means empowering and realizing the rights of persons with disability in the country. It should be considered as part and parcel of the poverty reduction strategy of the Ethiopian Federal Democratic Republic Government of Ethiopia.

2. Method of research

2.1 Study sites and organizations covered by the study

Five sites are selected due to their better access and wider employment opportunities for graduates with disabilities.

Table 1: Project sites and organizations covered by the study

Project Sites	Organizations				
Regional State	Governmental organizations/GOs	Non Governmental	Private		
Cities		Organizations/NGOs	sectors		
	Ministry of Education, Ministry of	Ethiopian National			
	Justice, Ministry of Labor and Social	Association of Blind,			
	Affairs, Bureau of Labor and Social	Ethiopian National			
Addis Ababa	Affairs, Addis Ababa University,	Association of Deaf,			
(Addis Ababa	Ethiopian Center of Disability and	Ethiopian National			
City	Development	Association of Persons			
Administration		with Motor Disability			
)					
	Adama University, Office of Justice,	Local NGOs	Private college		
Adama	Education Office, Bureau of labor				
(Oromoya	and social Affairs				
Regional State)					
Hawassa	Water engineering, Office of Justice,				
(Southern	Bureau of Labor and Social Affairs				
Nations, and					
Nationalities,					
and Peoples					
Regional State)					
Bahir Dar	Bahir Dar Textile Factory	Cheshire Foundation,			
(Amhara					
Regional Sate)					
Mekelle	Office of Justice, Education Bureau,	Disability	Dedebit micro		
(Tigray	Bureau of Lobor and Social Affairs,	Associations Women	Enterprise		
Regional State)	Mekelle University	disability Association			

2.2 Participants of the study

University graduating students with disabilities (192) Graduates students with disabilities (113), employers (32), and representatives of national associations of persons with disabilities (12) the sources of data.

2.3 Tools of data collection

Three instruments; questionnaire, (open and close ended items) interview and & Focus Group Discussion (FGD) were employed to collect data. Specifically open and close ended questionnaire and interview schedules as well as FGD are used to generate field data.

2.4 Procedures of Data collection

Five project coordinators were assigned from Addis Ababa for the respective five project sites to lead the field data collection. One local researcher assistant with special needs education back ground was researchers form respective project sites to assist in the field data collection. The field data collection took seven to ten days depending on arrangements of each site coordinator and availability of resource persons.

2.5 Data analysis

Data obtained are organized and analyzed thematically on the academic background and preparation of graduating students for the world of work employment status of GwDs, the major factors affecting their employment, the working conditions PwDs and suggestions to improve the employment of graduate students with disabilities.

3. Literature Review

3.1 Legislations and employment status of persons with disabilities

The Government of Ethiopia has developed a number of legislations a ratified many international conventions pertaining to the employment of people with disabilities. For instance, the Constitution of the Federal Democratic of Ethiopia (1995) in its Article 41(5) sets out the States' responsibility for the provisions of necessary rehabilitation and support services for people with disabilities. The Country's Proclamation concerning the Rights to employment for persons with disabilities (No.568/2008) makes null and void any law, practice, custom, attitude and other discriminatory situations that limit equal opportunities for persons with disabilities. This proclamation also requires employers to provide appropriate working and training conditions; take all reasonable accommodation measure and affirmative action's, particularly when employing women with disabilities and assign an assistant to enable a person with disability to perform their work or follow training. The Federal Civil Servant Proclamation (515/2007) provides for special preference in the recruitment, promotion and deployment of qualified candidates with disabilities. Developmental Social

Welfare Policy (1997) specifically targets people with disabilities and sets out to safe guard their rights and to promote opportunities for vocational rehabilitation.

The National Program of Action for Rehabilitation of persons with disabilities (1999) aims to enable persons with disabilities and promote a better standard of living by building their capacity and ensuring their equal rights and full participation in society. These all are few examples. In a nut shell, however, these are not yet all put in practice on the ground. There is a lot to be dame, to enforce and facilitate the implementation process.

In Ethiopia, higher education is expanding; however, access to students with disabilities is still negligible. Furthermore, the conditions for students with disabilities in higher education intuitions, is neither conducive nor supportive (Yared, 2008; MoE, 2010). To the few, who somehow manage to finish their studies, finding jobs is quite a challenge and if not impossible. During employment, most are discriminated and are also totally denied of their rights to employment merely for having impairment (ILO, 2009; Mindahun, 2006). In the world of work, they are discriminated on training and promotions. And, in most cases, they are not even provided with facilities that enable them to work properly (Mindahun, 2006; Aderie, 2006).

Though the unemployment and underemployment of persons with disabilities continue to be serious social problem in Ethiopia, there are still few persons employed in public and private sectors. However, employment for persons with disabilities in the country at large is not an easy process; requires a great deal of patience and fierce struggle. And often, it is not uncommon to find a number of unemployed persons with disabilities with the necessary job qualifications and with pertinent college diplomas that the job demands (*Tirussew*, 2005; National Employment Policy and Strategy of Ethiopia, 2009).

For many graduates with disabilities either there is no possibility of finding a job or the work they are able to obtain is usually menial with appropriate training (ILO, 1998). For instance, some findings indicate that many people with visual impairment encounter discrimination as they attempt both to acquire and retain jobs.

It has been further found that the blind and the physically impaired students have been discriminated during application and competition for jobs. What is more, some have been excluded from training and promotion (Mindahun, 2007).

3.2 Employment Processes and work Environment

The most frequently reported challenges faced in course of employment by persons with disabilities include; (inaccessible working offices, buildings, employers' unfavorable attitudes towards persons with disabilities, vacancies and employment rules exclude persons with disabilities, the need to disclose disability before employment, lack of information about vacancies, employers' lack of awareness regarding the rights of persons with disabilities for employment (Feruz, 2006).

Graduates with visual impairment, for example, face difficulties to find jobs although they have equal required qualifications with their sighted counterparts for (Keralem, 2006). It is reported that as either they had been screened out before approaching for tests or denied the opportunity to be hired after they passed the enterance tests. In fact, some are seen when working on streets peddling, it was further noted that the private sector has totally ignored the employment opportunity of persons with disabilities.

As to the working environment for PwDs, reasonable accommodations for workers with disabilities can range from simple to complex and cheap to expensive. Accommodations allow the worker with disabilities to perform the essential functions of the job and hence depend on the worker's disability and its effect on performance of essential job functions. Accommodations may include providing written, step-by-step instructions for job tasks; flexible work and leave schedules; rearrangement of work stations for accessibility; alternative key boards, voice recognition soft ware, and mobility or ergonomic assistive devices (Wonacott, 2003).

Employed persons with disabilities face discrimination at work place. In a study conducted by Keralem (2006) and Melanesia (2001) in some selected organizations in Addis Ababa, persons with visual impairments complained about discrimination in their job promotion even after they have secured the job. According to Mindahun (2006), study participants indicated unavailability of special necessary materials and equipments in work places for persons with disabilities in general and for persons with visual or physical impairments in particular. Braille materials are not provided for the blind at work places partly because it is not easy to find these materials in the market and partly because of ignorance or negligence of employers. As the discussants also raised, buildings are not constructed considering persons with physical disability, and as a result, any locations where they need to go to get services in

general, and work sites in particular are inaccessible for them. They also pointed out that hiring readers for the blind is being encouraged by the government, however, there are some employers who looked at this as extra expense for their agencies or resisted hiring persons with disabilities. In order to avoid addional expenses they reject candidates with visual and other impairments for employment.

Notices are posted on boards through ink, which the blind workers do not read unless their colleagues tell them. There is no any other arrangement in any of the agencies, where respondents of this research work, to enable workers with visual impairments see available notices. In fact, all of them reported, they lost no opportunities because of the inaccessibility of the posted notices.

3.3 Employers' Attitude toward PwDs

Employers play a critical role in addressing the high unemployment rate experienced by persons with disabilities. A number of researchers have identified employer attitudes toward persons with disabilities as an important factor in the staggering unemployment rate of persons with disabilities (Blanck, 1998; King, 1993; Smith, 1992). Although employers' attitudes toward individuals with disabilities have been studied extensively, the research has produced inconsistent findings. Some factors identified as positive attributes by some employers (e.g., attendance, safety, productivity) have been cited as concerns by employers in other studies (Nietupski, HamreNietupski, VanderHart, & Fishback, 1996).

According to Kassahun (2000), one obvious cause for low employment of persons with disabilities is discouraging attitude of the society. According to him, Ethiopians are known for their sympathy (i.e. feeling of sorrow) for persons with disabilities. This is, however, has never proved to bring about an overall independence of for the persons with disabilities. It has rather caused each individual to develop undesirable dependency and helplessness. Such feeling seems to have lessened the number of people with disabilities from the field of employment. Prejudice is even reflected in the minds of the teachers and instructors at various formal educational institutions.

4. Results

4.1. Employment Conditions of Graduates with Disabilities

Data was collected from 192 students with disabilities who are expecting to graduate from the sampled five universities in Ethiopia. There were 25% female and 75% male university students with disabilities in this study as indicated in Table 1.

Table 1. University Students with Disabilities by Study Sites and Gender

	Se	Total	
Study Site	Male	Female	
	43	4	47
Adama University	91.5%	8.5%	24.5%
	34	22	56
Addis Ababa University	60.7%	39.3%	29.2%
	20	0	20
Bahir Dar University	100.0%	.0%	10.4%
	21	7	28
Hawassa University	75.0%	25.0%	14.6%
	26	15	41
Mekelle University	63.4%	36.6%	21.4%
Total	144	48	192
	75.0%	25.0%	100.0%

About 17.1% of the sampled students' age was within the range of 18-20 years, about 66.9% of the students' age ranged from 21 to 24 years and the remaining 16% fall within 25 & 37 years of age.

4.1.1. Background

Participants by study site and gender

From among the 113 graduates with disabilities, 77 (68.1%) of them were males and 36 (31.9%) females as indicated in Table 1. The majority of the study participants or 45 (39.8%) were sampled from Addis Ababa while the remaining participants were from Adama (25.7%), Bahir Dar (16.8%), Mekelle (12.4%), and Hawassa (5.3%).

Table 2. Graduates with Disabilities by Gender and Study Sites

	5		
Study Sites	Male	Female	Total
Adama	22	7	29
	75.9%	24.1%	25.7%
Bahir Dar	12	7	19
	63.2%	36.8%	16.8%
Hawassa	4	2	6
	66.7%	33.3%	5.3%
Mekelle	8	6	14
	57.1%	42.9%	12.4%
Addis Ababa	31	14	45
	68.9%	31.1%	39.8%
Total	77	77 36	
	68.1%	31.9%	100.0%

Age of participants

Participants of this study ranged from ages 16 to 50 of which 88% were within the range of 21 and 40 years.

Table 3. Age of Graduates with Disabilities by Gender

	S	Sex	
Age	Male	Female	Total
16-20	3	1	4
	75.0%	25.0%	3.5%
21-25	16	13	29
	55.2%	44.8%	25.7%
26-30	24	14	38
	63.2%	36.8%	33.6%
31-35	15	4	19
	78.9%	21.1%	16.8%
36-40	11	3	14
	78.6%	21.4%	12.4%
Above 41	8	1	9
	88.9%	11.1%	8.0%
Total	77 36		113
	68.1%	31.9%	100.0%

Graduates with Disabilities by Gender and Disability Types

The majority of the sample participants of this study 52 (50.5%) are graduates with visual impairment followed by graduates with motor impairment, 36 (35%), and graduates with hearing impairments, 15 (14.6%). With regard to gender of graduates with disabilities, there were fewer participants of female graduates with hearing impairment which were only 2 (or 13.3%) while the remaining participants or 13 (or 86.7%) were males. On the other hand,

about one third of graduates with visual and motor impairments were females as indicated in Table 4.

Table 4. Type of Disability by Gender of Graduates with Disabilities

Type of	S		
Disability	Male Female		Total
Hearing	13	2	15
	86.7%	13.3%	14.6%
Visual	36	16	52
	69.2%	30.8%	50.5%
Motor	24	12	36
	66.7%	33.3%	35.0%
Total	73	30	103
	70.9%	29.1%	91.2%
Missing			10

Onset of Disability Impairment

As shown on Table 4, about 84% of the participants said that the onset of their disabilities occurred after birth while only about 16% said it occurred before birth. The onset of the motor impairment was after birth for about 94% of the respondents. Similarly, the onset of visual impairment was after birth for about 81% of the respondents. On the other hand, the onset of hearing impairment was after birth for 71% of the respondents.

Table 5. Onset of Impairment by Type

Type of	On	Onset		
Disability	Before birth	Before birth After birth		
-	4	10	14	
Hearing	28.6%	71.4%	13.9%	
	10	42	52	
Visual	19.2%	80.8%	51.5%	
	2	33	35	
Motor	5.7%	94.3%	34.7%	
Total	16	85	101	
	15.8%	84.2%	89.4%	
Missing			12	

Graduates with disabilities by field of training

The sampled graduates with disabilities graduated from different universities with various field of specialization. In this study, these fields of specializations were condensed based on five major categories: business, technical, teaching, law, and social sciences. Accordingly,

the majority of respondent graduates with disabilities or 36 (38.3%) were trained in the teaching professions followed by social sciences (21.3%), law (20.2%), business (11.7%), and technical (8.5%), as indicated in Table 6.

The field of training was also examined by disability type of graduates. Most visually impaired graduates were trained as teachers in different fields (66.7%), law (63.2%) and social studies (55.0%). On the other hand, the majority of graduates with motor disability (63.6%) graduated from business fields while the majority of those with hearing impairment (50.0%) graduated from technical fields..

Table 6. Field Studied by Graduates with Disabilities by Type of Impairment

Field Studied	Type of D	Type of Disability		Total
	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Teaching: Civic and ethical education, Geography,	4	24	8	36
History Teaching, Special Needs				
Education, Educational Psychology,				
Mathematics Education, Statistics,	11.1%	66.7%	22.2%	38.3%
English Language, Ethiopian Languages,				
Sign language andLinguistics				
Social Studies: Political Science, Social Work,	1	11	8	20
Sociology and Others	5.0%	55.0%	40.0%	21.3%
Law	0	12	7	19
	0.0%	63.2%	36.8%	20.2%
Business: Accounting, Economics, Management	3	1	7	11
and Purchasing	27.3%	9.1%	63.6%	11.7%
Technical: Automotive, electricity, metal work,	4	1	3	8
furniture, drafting.	50.0%	12.5%	37.5%	8.5%
Total	12	49	33	94
	12.8%	52.1%	35.1%	83.2%
Missing				19
				16.8%

University Experiences of Graduates with Disabilities

Participants of the study were asked to tell ab out how they joined their field of study study in the university

About 78% of the graduates said that their area of specialization was their own choice while 22% of the respondents said it was not their choice. The reasons why the field they studied was not their choice were the following:

- Placement was by chance/ lottery method
- Because I was informed that their were best fields for deaf

- Because there is no other alternative
- Assignment was through national exam results
- I did not get any other opportunity rather than be a teacher
- There was no chance to choose my interest

Service Provisions for Students with Disabilities during their University Education

- Pocket money: 120 birr per month
- Braille library, Braille paper, text books written in Braille
- Tape recorder and audio-cassettes
- Readers (at the time of exam the university paid to our supporters)
- Computer rooms, free photocopy services, scanner and access to internet
- Sign language interpreters were available in some cases
- Dormitory priority was given to us
- Teachers support

Inadequacy of Service Provisions for Students with Disabilities during their University Education:

- Service inadequate; inconvenient buildings, there was no lift in the building where I learned
- The support was not well organized propely
- No provisions for motor impairment students in the university
- No special provision at all since I was a student in the summer program
- No special assistance as I have learned in evening/extension program
- Only friends were interprating what the teachers was saying
- No support, students and teachers have low attitude to students with disablites

Orientation / Guidance about the World of Work

A question was posed to explore the availability of orientation and guidance about the world of work before graduation.

The majority of the respondents 77 (or 79%) said that they didn't receive orientation and guidance services about the world of work during their university stay as indicated in Table 7.

Table 7. Receive Orientation /Guidance about the world of work during your University/college education by Type of Disability

Received any orientation /guidance	Тур	e of Disabili	ty	Total
about the world of work during your University/college education?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	5	10	5	20
	41.7%	19.2%	15.2%	20.6%
No	7	42	28	77
	58.3%	80.8%	84.8%	79.4%
Total	12	52	33	97
	12.4%	53.6%	34.0%	85.8%
Missing				16

On the other hand, about 21% of the respondents said that they had the opportunity to receive orienation and guidance about the world of work while they were pursuing thier studies in their respective universities and colleges. The focus of the orientations /guidance services they had received included:

- How to prepare CV; how to participate in interviews, how to get employers, application writing e.t.c.
- How to search job, how to get the attentions of employers and
- How to apply my studies in practice; how to contact various courts and oganization during practice
- Entrepreneurship practices
- How to relate/communicate with people
- The orientation are how to participate for activities with others

Due to lack of guidance or orientation about employment what challenges did you face?

- I missed opportunities
- Being new to the world of work
- Challenge of CV preparation and interview techniques
- Challenges at exam time
- Challenges for work registration
- Stress on how to get a job
- Difficulty in knowing rules and regulations of working place
- Employers are not happy, to employe graduates with disabilities especially NGOs
- Even if I did not receive guidance, I get it from my friends and other peoples

- Face difficulty to join the world of work and it's challenge for me to create my own job
- Frustration in classroom management as a teacher, making staff friends, fear of expressing ideas in meetings etc
- Joblessness no money to start ones own work
- Limitation on how to compete for job, job searching, creating job
- Lack of knowledge about places where notices and vacancies are posted
- Being unfamilier the in type of questions that appear during, interview session
- Lose of confidence
- How to submit my CV to the concerned body, and find job according one's field of study

What do you suggest should have been done?

The participants were asked to suggest what should have been done on the part of the university before graduation. They have come up with the following suggestions:

- All departments must give orientation and guidance during the study period
- All sectors and public officials should be have awareness about PwDs
- Department selection should be given priority to students with disablites
- Emphasis and attention must be given to PwDs in job palcement
- Exams should be prepared in Braille or Audio format
- Employers should be given short term training program
- Notices should be written and posted on Braille paper
- Increase the no and availability of materials, working with NGO's and GO's for better facilities
- Developing quotas for graduate students in the labor market
- It will be good if there is employment related course
- Job related/vocational guidance be given to people with disabilities
- There should be necessary regulations for good job opportunity
- Orientation prior to application helps a lot in terms of enhancing self esteem and produce a better CV
- Organizations panel discussions on work and disability
- Orientation about the working condition and how to cope-up with challenges
- Training on entrepreneurship and micro credits should be in palce

- Career counseling should be introduced
- University administrators including the president shall be aware about the difficulties of graduate students for employment and shall make link with GOs and NGOs
- University should give priority to students with disability in department selection

4.1.2. Employment Conditions of Graduates with disabilities

4.1.2.1. Current Employment Status

As indicated on Table 8, about 65% of the graduates with disabilities are employed and 35% are unemployed. From among these, about 78% of females and 59% of males are employed, while about 22% of females and 41% of males are unemployed.

Table 8. Current Employment Status of Respondents by Type of Disability and Gender

		Type of Disability			Total
Gender	Are you currently employed?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Male	Yes	7	21	13	41
		17.1%	51.2%	31.7%	59.4%
	No	5	13	10	28
		17.9%	46.4%	35.7%	40.6%
	Sub-Total	12	34	23	69
		17.4%	49.3%	33.3%	71.1%
Female	Yes	2	12	8	22
		9.1%	54.5%	36.4%	78.6%
	No	0	2	4	6
		.0%	33.3%	66.7%	21.4%
	Sub-Total	2	14	12	28
		7.1%	50.0%	42.9%	28.9%
	Yes	9	33	21	63
		14.3%	52.4%	33.3%	64.9%
	No	5	15	14	34
		14.7%	44.1%	41.2%	35.1%
Both Sexes	Grand Total	14	48	35	97
		14.4%	49.5%	36.1%	85.8%

Reasons for not getting job:

- Lack of awareness and good will of employer.
- Shortage of information about vacancy annoncement
- Due to employers attituid factor towards my impairment
- Organizational and personal biases; preoccupied thoughts about disability
- Lack of proper understanding about disability
- Lack of positive thinking and positive attitude about PwDs
- Due to plenty number of competitors

4.1.2.2. Employment Stories

Employment Processes

Graduates were asked how they got employed. The following lists were their responses to open ended questionnaire:

- By applying to the job post
 - o By searching vacancy notices
 - By consulting various sources of vacancy announcements such as ethiojob online service
 - o Read in announcements in newspaper nor magazine
 - o Searching vacancy announcements posted outside on the board
 - By applying to different organizations
 - o Based on my application for employment in the organization I got the job
 - o By applying to different government and non-government organizations
 - o After exertin a lot of job I got the job
 - o By competing with other qualified job seekers who have no disabilities
- Through quota system
 - o By government initiation (quotas)
 - o Because of government quota allocation
- Through assignment
 - o Direct assignment by the Ministry of Education
 - o After discharging some free service to the organization
- Through a circular letter
 - The Civil Service Ministry /Bureau has passed a circular letter to different organization to give chance of employment fir PwDs
- Through consultation
 - o By consulting with the organization face to face
 - Private NGOs organizations did not accept me but one organization working for PwDs recruited
- Through social connections
 - o Through my friends
 - o Through people I know

Furthermore, respondents were asked how long it took them to get employed. As indicated on Table 9, results showed that:

- About 17% of the graduates with visual impairment got their job in less than a year after graduation.
- The majority of the employed respondents or about 87% of those employed with disabilities got their job within two years after graduation.

Table 9. Time Spent before Getting a Job by Disability Type

	How long	How long did it take you to get employed after graduation?							
Type of Disability	Less than a year								
Hearing	2	1	3	2	8				
_	25.0%	12.5%	37.5%	25.0%	11.6%				
Visual	19	14	1	0	34				
	55.9%	41.2%	2.9%	-	49.3%				
Motor	12	12	2	1	27				
	44.4%	44.4%	7.4%	3.7%	39.1%				
Total	33	27	6	3	69				
	47.8%	39.1%	8.7%	4.3%	61.1%				

If it took you more than a year to get a job, what do you think were the reasons?

- Disability related attitudes and misunderstandings
- Low awareness of educated and non educated people about PwDs
- Lack of access to information and negative attitude of employers
- The field was new for PwDs and the employers are not willing to accept
- The vacancy announcements state that only persons without disability can apply
- Our training lacked practical or work-related experience
- Lack of university or college on job training education

Accessibility of Vacancy Announcement

Whether vacancy announcements were accessible or not were also explored. Results showed that about 52.6% of the respondents said that vacancy announcements were accessible to them while the remaining 47.4% said it was not accessible to them as summarized on Table 10.

Table 10. Accessibility of Vacancy Announcement by Type of Disability

Were vacancy announcements accessible for you?	Type o	Total		
	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	7	15	19	41
	63.6%	41.7%	61.3%	52.6%
No	4	21	12	37
	36.4%	58.3%	38.7%	47.4%
Total	11	36	31	78
	14.1%	46.2%	39.7%	69.0%

In an open ended questionnaire respondents were asked the reasons why vacancy announcements are not accessible and they are listed here under:

- Unable to buy magazines,
- Unable to listen radio
- Cannot read, ink print and braille print announcement
- Very far away to follow and find the day to day vacancies announcements
- Not physically accessable

Relevance of University Training to Current Employment

As indicated in Table 11, the majority of the university graduates with disabilities (91.4%) said their field of specialization matches their current occupation. This pattern of matching between training type and current occupation is relatively similar for graduates with hearing impairment (81.8%), for those with visual impairment (100%), and for those with motor impairment (84%).

Table 11. Extent of Matching Current Occupation with Area of Study by Disability

Type

Type of Disability	Does your current occarea o	Total	
	Yes	No	
Hearing	9	2	11
	81.8%	18.2%	15.7%
Visual	34	0	34
	100.0%	.0%	48.6%
Motor	21	4	25
	84.0%	16.0%	35.7%
Total	64	6	70
	91.4%	8.6%	61.9%

Experiences during job applications

Graduates with disabilities were asked whether they had encountered any kind of discrimination because of their impairments during job application and interview. About 39% (or 30/77) respondents said that they were discriminated against due to their disabilities while the majority or 61% said they were not discriminated against as summarized on Table 12.

Table 12. Experienced discrimination because of your impairment at the time of application or interview by type of disability

Did you encounter discrimination	Tyl	oility	Total	
because of your impairment at the time of application or interview?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	5	13	12	30
	45.5%	36.1%	40.0%	39.0%
No	6	23	18	47
	54.5%	63.9%	60.0%	61.0%
Total	11	36	30	77
	14.3%	46.8%	39.0%	68.1%
Missing				36

4.1.2.3. Working Environments

Employing Organizations

Respondents were asked in which organizations they were employed and about 69.6% of those employed said they work for governmental organizations while about 27.5% said they work for non-governmental organizations. Only 2.9% said they have their own business.

Table 13. Type of the Organizations Graduates with Disabilities Work for by Type of Disability

What is the type of Organization you	Type			
are working for?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	Total
	3	28	17	48
Governmental Organization	6.3%	58.3%	35.4%	69.6%
	4	6	9	19
Non-governmental Organization	21.1%	31.6%	47.4%	27.5%
	2	0	0	2
Own business	100.0%	.0%	.0%	2.9%
	9	34	26	69
Total	13.0%	49.3%	37.7%	61.1%

Awareness of Employers about the Employability of Graduates with Disabilities

Whether graduates believe that employers have adequate awareness about the competence of graduates with disability was assessed and about 55.2% of respondent graduates with disabilities said that they believe employers have adequate awareness while about 44.8% said they don't have the awareness. This result varied with disability type where the majority of graduates with visual impairment or about 52.9% said that they don't think that employers have adequate awareness about the competence of graduates with disabilities as indicated on Table 14.

Table 14. Employers Awareness about the Competence of Persons with Disability by Type of Disability

Do you think your employers have adequate	Type of Disability			
awareness about the competency of persons with disability?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	Total
Yes	5	16	16	37
	62.5%	47.1%	64.0%	55.2%
No	3	18	9	30
	37.5%	52.9%	36.0%	44.8%
Total	8	34	25	67
	11.9%	50.7%	37.3%	59.3%
Missing				46

Treatment of Colleagues and Employers in Work Settings

After graduates with disability get employed the treatment of the treatment of their colleagues and their bosses were also assessed. The majority of the respondents or about 82.9% said that their colleagues treat them like other staff members while about 17.1% said they were not properly treated by their colleagues the way they do it to other members of the staff as summarized in Table 15.

Table 15. Treatment of Colleagues in Work Settings by Disability Type

Did your colleagues treat you like they treat Type or			nent	Total
any other personnel in the organization?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	4	32	22	58
	50.0%	91.4%	81.5%	82.9%
No	4	3	5	12
	50.0%	8.6%	18.5%	17.1%
Total	8	35	27	70
	11.4%	50.0%	38.6%	61.9%
Missing				43

Graduates with disabilities were also asked whether their bosses treat them equally in the same way they do it for colleagues without disability. About two third of the respondents (65.7%) agreed that their bosses treated them like other colleagues in their work setting while the remaining 34.3% said they were not equally treated. When disaggregated by disability type, about 62.5% of the respondents with hearing impairment said their bosses did not equally treat them like the other colleagues without disability.

Table 16. Treatment of Bosses in Work Settings by Disability Type

Did your Bosses treat you like they treat	Тур	Type of Disability		
any other personnel in the organization?				
	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	3	24	19	46
	37.5%	66.7%	73.1%	65.7%
No	5	12	7	24
	62.5%	33.3%	26.9%	34.3%
Total	8	36	26	70
	11.4%	51.4%	37.1%	61.9%
Missing				43

Equity of Salary Payment in Work Settings

Respondents were also asked whether they have been paid an equitable salary as compared to colleagues who have similar qualifications. As shown on Table 17, the majority of the respondents about 94% said they get paid within the same salary scale as their colleagues who have similar qualifications and experiences. This response pattern was different for graduates with hearing impairment where about 37.5% said they were not paid like their colleagues who have the same qualifications.

Table 17. Perceived Equity of Salary Payment by Disability Type

Do you get paid the same as your	Тур	lity	Total	
colleagues who have the same qualification?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	5	34	24	63
	62.5%	100.0%	96.0%	94.0%
No	3	0	1	4
	37.5%	.0%	4.0%	6.0%
Total	8	34	25	67
	11.9%	50.7%	37.3%	59.3%
				46

Perceived Employers' Satisfaction of Job Performance of Graduates with Disabilities

Whether graduates with disabilities perceive that their employers are satisfied with their job performance was assessed. As it is shown on Table 18, the majority of the respondents, or about 92.5%, said that their employers are satisfied with their performances on the job.

Table 18. Perceived Employers' Satisfaction of Job Performance of Graduates with Disability by Disability Type

Do you think your employers are	Тур	Total		
satisfied with your performance?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	6	32	24	62
	85.7%	94.1%	92.3%	92.5%
No	1	2	2	5
	14.3%	5.9%	7.7%	7.5%
Total	7	34	26	67
	10.4%	50.7%	38.9%	59.3%
Missing				46

Modifications to Accommodate the Needs of Graduates with Disabilities in Work Settings

The majority of the respondents about 62.1% said that there were no modifications made for them in the work environment after they were employed while about 37.9% said they got some forms of modifications in their work environment as it is shown on Table 19. From among these respondents the majority of graduates with hearing disability about 85.7% and graduates with motor disability about 73.1% said their work setting was not modified for them after employment.

Table 19. Modifications made after Employment of Graduates with Disabilities by Disability Type

Are there modifications made for you after	Type of Disability			Total
you are employed in this organization?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	1	17	7	25
	14.3%	51.5%	26.9%	37.9%
No	6	16	19	41
	85.7%	48.5%	73.1%	62.1%
Total	7	33	26	66
	10.6%	50.0%	39.4%	58.4%
Missing				47

Those who endorsed that they got their work environment was modified for them after they were employed coming with the listed following modifications.

- Necessary things for work were available and the office is willing to cooperate with me
- Arrangement of accessible chair & table
- Availability of readers, softweare, adapted technology /Jaw program/ different accessories for various purposes,
- Change of work, though it adds load, extracurricular activities but no salary in the increment
- Work site preference
- Office room arrangement from first floor to ground
- Provisions of computers, Braille materials/styles and stylus
- Priority is given to me
- All things I need were given to me
- In my office all barriers are removed /office arranged to the needs
- Promotion to the highest level and increasing salary according to my responsibility

If NO, what modifications do you suggest should be in place for you?

- Accessible physical environment
- Accessibilities through adapted technology, such as computes, Braille should be maintained
- JAWS software to computer and internet access
- Assistive materials, type writer should be provided
- Braille books, and materials the styles and slates, white cane, car services
- Mobility training/orientation and creating barrier free environment
- The walk ways to the facilities and offices should be modified

Personal Assistant

About 27.5% of the respondents said that they have personal assistants. When this data was disaggregated by disability type, about 42.9% of graduates with visual impairment had personal assistants, followed by those with hearing impairment (30.0%) and motor impairment (4.2%) as shown in Table 20. In other words, about 95.8%, 70% and 57.1% of

graduates with motor, hearing and visual impairments do not respectively have personal assistants in the work settings.

Table 20. Presence of Personal Assistant by Type of Disability

	Ty	Type of Disability			
Do you have personal assistant?	Hearing	Visual	Motor		
Yes	3	15	1	19	
	30.0%	42.9%	4.2%	27.5%	
No	7	20	23	50	
	70.0%	57.1%	95.8%	72.5%	
Total	10	35	24	69	
	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	

Respondents' Reflections on the Way Forward

• Create Awareness

- Create awareness raising programs, creating equal job opportunities,
 establishing organizations who work for rights of persons with disability.
- o Awareness change programs through government and private medias.
- Promotion of rights and implementation of conventions, policies, proclamation should be done.
- o Teach the society about people with disabilities through different medias
- o Advocacy work by government of concerned bodies should be done
- Employers should know legislations related to employment of person with disabilities.
- o Legislations and proclamations should be distributed to every employer.
- o Providing training, prepare manuals and distribute those for employers

Change attitude

- o Government should make a change to make manager have good attitude
- Even media have to work to change attitude of the outside society and employers
- o Should expand access and giving training for employers

• Formulate more feasible policy

- o A more practical policy should be developed
- o Besides the existing legislation more focused policies are needed
- o Improve policy by involving scholars with disablity

- o Special employment policy must be designed with full protocols to follow-up
- Re-shape policy and procedures and aware the employers and PwDs themselves
- Provide priority to persons with disability
 - o Giving job guidance prior by formulating policies and implementation
 - o Give priority to persons with disability
- Enforcement of laws related with disability
 - Rules and regulations on employment rights should be made and implemented.
 - o Enforce proclamation and rules and regulation real on the ground.
 - o Government should apply all regulation and UN conventions
 - The government should take action on the owners of an accessibility buildings. The implementation of employment proclamation 568/2008 should be enforced
- Provide information, guidance and training
 - o Enforce guidance; provide enough counseling and orientation for employers
 - o Government leaders must given training for this employers
 - The legislations document must be distributed to the employers and training must be given
- Provide support system
 - Provide affirmative action; put special and visible affirmative action of employment opportunities
 - o Fulfilling facilities & provision of modifications
 - o Use and expansion of adoptive technology,
 - Should encourage organizations which employe PwDs by reducing tax and giving duty free previlige
 - o Supportive measures should be taken for example Braille, computer
 - o Financial support and training for PwDs
- Associations working for the rights of persons with disabilities
 - Organizations like us (ECDD) should strengthen their work of delivering disability awareness trainings about PwDs
 - o National associations should be empowered
 - National associations should collaborate with employers

- National Associations of Persons with Disabilities have to tryu to address the negative attitute of the society
- National associations should give training for PwDs on life skill, create a good net work among employers and employees, do many activities and cooperate with the government

4.2 Employers

Interview was conducted in five major cities Addis Ababa, Adama, Bahir Dar, Hawassa and Mekele. A total of 32 employers were interviewed, 20 are from Governmental Organizations (GOs), 9 are from Non-governmental Organizations (NGOs) and 3 are from private organizations. The respondents include 6 female and 26 male interviewees. Organizations involved in the study were Ministry of Justice, (MOJ), Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MOLSA), Bureau of Labor and Social Affairs (BOLSA), Ministry of Education (MOE), Regional Education Buerau (REB), Bahir Dar Textile Factory, Addis Ababa University (AAU), Adama University (AU), Water Engineering Institute, Ethiopian Center for Disability Development (ECDD) and Cheshire Foundation.

The interviewees of the different organizations were managers, heads of personnel departments, and directors of human resource sections and project coordinators. The interview was focused on the process and procedures of employment of persons with disabilities, working conditions of persons with disabilities and reflections on the way forward. The following paragraphs portray the highlights of the interview results captured both from the participants of governmental and non-governmental organizations.

4.2.1 Process and procedures of employment GOs and NGOs

The participants of the study from GOs and NGOs revealed that they usually employ people with visual and motor impairments. On the other hand, AAU and ECDD reported that they employ diverse graduates including those with hearing, visual, and motor disabilities. This result indicates the scope of the employment chance for persons with hearing impairments is relatively narrower than from the other groups.

With regard to procedures used for vacancy announcements, different opinions were observed in terms of whether the vacancy announcements were accessible to persons with disabilities or not. Participants reflected different views about vacancy announcements some say;

"Vacancy advertisements are announced in weekly news papers or daily news papers like "Addis Zemen" (Ethiopian Local Newspaper) and think that is the best way to reach the population. However, others express the difficulty for persons with disabilities to reach the information from the news papers"

At the moment, there is no system designed to reach people with disabilities beyond the traditional system. However, AAU and ECDD use recommendations and websites for vacancy announcements. On another note, the participants from MOLSA reported people with disabilities do not have full confidence about their rights and he further stated that:

"They are very much encouraged to come and apply the job on their side except that some ask us through telephone by saying "we know you will not employ us but can we apply for a vacancy you announced?" being very much biased. The respondent added, let them come to us and see the reality instead of being pessimistic and discouraged from the outset."

Furthermore, the interviewees from the Ministry of Education (MoE) and AAU disclosed that they have received new circular from the government to employ people with disabilities as affirmative action. One of the interviewees further pointed out;

"We have got a circular in August 2012 from civil service Minister with the list of about 52 graduates with disabilities to be employed without any examination as long as there is a place /vacancy which fits their qualifications".

With regard to **the employment** process most of the participants reported that they follow government proclamations. The interviewee from Adama University reported that they offer employment priorities for persons with disabilities as long as they meet the requirements and qualify for the position. It was also reported that gender priorities are given in processing the candidates' employment and stated the following."

"In our society the status of females is very low. Being female and having disability make things complex. Today, the Ethiopian government is taking measure to alleviate the problem. Adama University with its gender office is also making progress to reduce the impact of such kind of problems. For instance in every employment process, gender office has one representative. This shows how our University is working to realize the equality of all people."

The participant from the Ministry of Justice has the following to stay;

"As you know this is a justice office. We work for the benefit of the society and making sure laws are respected. We first respect the law and work to ensure others to respect. The law gives priority to vulnerable groups such as children, people with disabilities, females, elders and others. So we are working to ensure the rights of the population with special emphasis on disadvantaged groups. Coming to your question people with disabilities are highly encouraged in the employment process. There is a positive discrimination for people with disability and female applicants. Ethiopian labor proclamation also supports this idea. Large numbers of PwDs serve as lawyers in our institution. If I am not mistaken it is in the justice office that large number of

people with disabilities specially persons with disabilities are working. It is their constitutional right to come to our office for employment. It is not an office that individuals are favored or rejected. Let me tell you my observation in working with people with disabilities. For instance, a blind lawyer has many customers than any other sighted person. Unlike in other institutions, in our office people with disabilities are highly respected by the office and customers, as well. And I think it is a good example to other employing organizations."

Generally, unlike the GOs; NGOs and private organizations show diverse procedures and processes of employment. As to one of the participants of the NGOs, there is no clear guideline about the employment of persons with disabilities; further elaborated the situation as follows:

"To tell you the truth we don't have any guideline or principle to employ anybody, whether a person is with or without disability. We believe people with disabilities should compete rather than expecting support from employers. Favoring them in the employment process makes them dependant. We believe disability is not inability. I never forget a blind teacher who taught me when I was a high school student. He was very dynamic and intelligent. What I mean here is as long as the applicant fulfills the required skill, we don't mind whoever the applicant is. I believe on equality. All human being have inherent ability to succeed in any circumstances. We should help them to succeed to the required stage and not favoring them in the employment process. We should neither favor nor disfavor anybody on the basis individual differences."

Another interviewee expresses a practice in his organization as follows;

"We will not select because he/she has disability or we will not reject because he she has disability. Both applicants will be measured on the pre-determined selection criteria. The right person with the right skill will be selected. However, if two applicants have the same score, applicants with certain kinds of impairment will be favored."

A manger of a disability-based NGO says his organization favor people with disabilities better than GOs or private organizations; further states;

"As I told you earlier my organization is disability based organization and we are more than happy to employ if they come to our organization. But we don't employ them because of their impairment. We are especially interested on those living with different types of impairments and who are competent enough. If they are not competent enough we reject them."

There are interviewees from private enterprises who pretend to be positive about employing people with disabilities, but they do not want to hide that it has negative effects from the side of their customers according to one of the interviewees:

"The society has negative attitude towards people with disabilities and I am member of the society. Like any other employer I have some doubt. But you need to respect

their humanity. That is why they are working in our organization. I don't want to question their talents. They are very intelligent but societal and environmental barriers may inhibit them from functioning positively. On the other hand we need our organization to stay alive with better performances and achievements; as a result you may be afraid of employing persons with disabilities. The other thing, I would like to tell you that, when you employ such kind of people your customers are not happy".

On the same note another participant from private organization stated that;

"Obviously this is a private business organization and you don't want to incur loss. You rather may aspire more benefits so if you suspect a person with disability may not have the right skill to the required post, you may reject hmi/her. This doesn't mean that without any competition you will discard him/her. To make things clear if two applicants have the same competency as a matter of fact you may prefer a person without impairment."

4.2.2 Working Environment

In this part of the interview attempt is made to indentify the modifications and supports provided to accommodate the needs of PwDs in the GOs and NGOs. It was discovered that major of the interviewees disclosed the non-existant of special support or modification to assist employees with disabilities. However, the interviewees from Mekele reported the availability of special arrangements such as the provision of Braille, transportation service, material support, and appropriate working conditions for PwDs at work place. Further more, participants from Addis Ababa University and Adama University mentioned special considerations such as provision of housing near the working place and assigning fixed classroom for teaching respectively.

Among the major challenges encountered in the working places as mentioned by the interviewees include lack of assistance like reader for the blind or sign language interpreter for the deaf, inaccessibility of buildings, mobility barriers, lack of adaptive technologies and negative working atmosphere.

4.2.3 Suggestions to Improve the Employment Conditions

- o Empowering PwDs through education, and increasing their social and political participation
- o Introducing affirmative action and creating making flexible and inclusive regulations of civil service, announcements provision of special consideration
- o Mainstreaming of disability issues at work places
- o Creating barrier free environment in the work place
- o Persons with disabilities should fight for their rights

- o The need to sensitize and raise the awareness of the employers
- Developing a strategy follow-up which monitors and follow-up the enforcement of the policies and proclamations on the ground.

4.3 National Associations of Persons with Disabilities

A total of twelve participants from the Ethiopian National Association of Deaf (ENAD), the Ethiopian National Association of the Blind (ENAB), Ethiopian National Association of Persons with Motor Disability (ENAPwMD) participated in the Focus Group Discussion (FGD). The FGD was conducted in the premises of Addis Ababa University, at different times with representatives of the respective associations. The participants are first degree holders and some are studying for their masters in the graduate program. Each association sent four representatives, out of which ENAD is represented by two male and two female discussants, ENAB representatives were four and all were female participants and ENAPwMD were two and all participants were male. The proportions of male and female participants were equal in number. Their age range was between 25to 40.All are residents of Addis Ababa.

The themes of discussion were on:

- Employment status of PwDs
- Major factors affecting the employment of PwDs,
- Working conditions of PwDs, and
- Intervention that should be considered to improve the employability of PwDs.

4.3.1 Employment Status of PwDs

Participants disclosed that employment is a challenge for PwDs. In some areas, people with disabilities do not get acceptances even if they fulfill the required criteria for the vacancy as one of the discussants presented a case as follows:

After graduation I went to Wollo [in search of job]. I competed for a job and stood first from among the applicants. When I started the employment process I was told 'this is not possible for me; that I cannot qualify for the position.' I asked them why and told them that I passed the exam and I was capable of doing what others could do. Then, they insulted me "you are blind and you cannot teach; our students cannot accept you. Even your presence in the classroom is not good for their education."

Even after securing the job, the challenge continues everywhere. Accordingly one of the discussion participants disclosed her own experience the condition as follows:

So I had to go to regional states [to look for employment] since private schools [in Addis Ababa] were not willing to employ blind teachers. I am a single mother. I had to leave my daughter with my mother. You can imagine how this could be psychologically damageing; I am a female with disability, I had to go outside of Addis Ababa in search of job When there is a family member with disability [like me] parents are very stressed and worried. My parents have had invested a lot on me.

She further explained, placement area is a major challenge facing graduates with disabilities. The place where she was assigned to work was very remote and difficult for a blind person. She disclosed the situation as follows;

I had to go to a place called Aletea Wondo which is near Hawassa [about 350 Kms away from Addis] since I was assigned to teach there. I had to fight with education leaders during the placement of my working place that I could get at least services for transportation, water and electricity since many of the vacant positions were remote areas. In doing so, I had to argue with education leaders [that they should assign me in nearby towns]. I thought I could even quit the job and stay with my mother in Addis.

She further stated that;

I was determined to argue with the local authorities that even when other graduates with disabilities are employed in such areas education leaders should create conducive working environment for graduates with disabilities. Even then, their responses surprised me; many of them said to me 'this place is not convenient to you, why didn't they [education leaders in Addis Ababa] assign you in Addis Ababa'.

On the other hand, one association representative discussant stressed on the point of attitudinal and awareness problem as follows:

Here we have to high light the issue of awareness. For example in Addis Ababa University we told them we are deaf, and then they refused to give us written materials! I do not know from where they got the information that deaf cannot read,

this is ridicules. We learn in the same classroom but people assume that the teachers give us good results as charity; some do not believe we can read. This is the culture we have, for example a white man though illiterate he has better opportunity than black man similarly non disabled is assumed better than the disabled. In general, we would like to say there is lack of awareness and attitudinal problem.

Moreover, getting of employed by itself is a crucial problem particularly to those with disabilities. Discussants from three associations have similar ideas, on this point. Accordingly they disclosed that there are graduates who never get employment, some go back to begging, some are under employed below their qualifications even those who are employed have waited and suffered a year or more. In this regard there are a number of sad stories, as one of the discussants point out:

There is one graduate from the Department Philosophy, Addis Ababa University with wheelchair; he applied in so many places without success, now he is among news paper distributors in the street of Addis. There are a number of graduates with disabilities selling lottery tickets, and who some are beggars.

Besides these challenges, the discussants underscored the roles played by the associations particularly ENAB in keeping the rights of employment for PwDs. Two cases were cited as how the association fought for the rights graduates who were rejected by employers

Case 1 brought his case to the Ethiopian National Association for the Blind (ENAB). The association (ENAB) challenged the employers and finally he was employed. What the employers had thought was that he would quit claiming for his right but that didn't happen.

Case 2 had to report to the Ethiopian National Association for the Blind (ENAB). ENAB sued his employers and they pleaded guilty. Then he was employed and later on transferred to Addis Ababa. Now he is in a higher position."

In the discussion, it was expressed that employment opportunities are more severe for female graduates with disabilities. The discussants have expressed the severity of the employment problem as follows.

Persons with disabilities do not have equal chance for employment. Even when we are short listed based on our CV without photo or any other indicator of disability we are may be invited for the screening test otherwise we cancelled out from the list. When

we qualify based on our document (or credentials) or written test they do not include us to appear for interview by observing our disability. Even when we get the highest score on the test or based on documents (credentials), they change the rank to a reserve level or sometimes they tell us that the test was tough for us.

Regarding employment, male graduates with disabilities tend to have better chances than female graduates, regarding this discussants argued as follows:

There is a difference between males and females with disabilities. Male graduates with disabilities have better access to information. They move around Arat Kilo, they ask questions, they have the courage and the culture also shaped them that way. Female graduates do not explore or move here and there to search job like males do.

The study further revealed that the unequal treatment of graduates seem greater in private organizations and NGOs compared to governmental institutions. One of the discussants pointed out that:

In my view, the possibility for our employment in private organization is very low unless we are employed by government organizations. I was once assigned to work for a private school in Addis Ababa but they told me 'our students are not familiar to a teacher who is blind and you will be a unique person for them; how can you work'. I tried to explain to them that I will not be unique to the students since they observe the existence of visually impaired teachers through the television. Although I insisted to let them give me the chance to try but they didn't show me a positive remark. Then, I felt that even after we graduated from a university we still encounter various challenges including psychological damage; I am not personally happy.

Another discussant additionally cited her observation as follows

My observation is here in Addis Ababa. I know one sociologist who competed for employment and got the best result. When they saw him physically or in person they noticed that he is visually impaired and they told him that he does deserve it.

The study further indicated that employers favor in nongovernmental organization to hire non disabled, for the reason that PwDs are considered to be in efficient. In this regard comparatively governmental organizations are by far better than non government organizations in accepting and providing better employment options for persons with disabilities.

Graduates of PwDs do not have the chance to compete equally with nondisabled persons for the same vacancy though they do have equal qualification. Some job announcement criteria intentionally exclude candidates with disabilities. Regarding this, discussants' experience is presented as follows:

The exclusion starts from the announcement. It could be announced on the television or through other means but it specifies that he/she should be fully healthy. The neglect starts from here. I am astonished that although I have a first degree I see so many people who do not have university degree but with only short training occupying higher employment positions. Even there are some graduates with disabilities who have master's degree but could not get job. If I have the power and authority I would rectify such irregularities. There are employees with lower training such as with diploma who earn much better than those better qualified or with Master's degree without exaggeration. If I apply for such high paying positions they might laugh at me or they might consider me as if I got a favor. Such attitudes are common among employers.

In some places, after the applicants successfully passed/fulfilled the required criteria the vacancy will be canceled for unknown reason. Furthermore, FGD participants also emphasized the challenges more on vacancy announcement formats as their accessibilities:

They are not accessible for PwDs, they are not conducive for appropriated PwDs, if they are done in ink print format blinds do not read it, if it is oraly transmitted through radio or TV, we deaf could not understand the message. In some instances, the place where registration is done is up stairs where persons with motor impairments could not reach it,

Therefore, both the written and oral formats as well as the place where the announcement is posted is challenging to PwDs. For these practical reasons, PwDs disabled missed to compete for the vacancy. Hence, respondents suggested actions to be taken to minimize obstacles and make the formats of announcements as inclusive as possible. As to the obtained data the government has to take the lines share and has to enforce labor law in all NGOs and GOs.

4.3.2 Major Factors Affecting the Employment of PwDs

Participants of the study disclosed the following major factors affecting employments' of persons with disabilities. Lack of awareness, as creation of wrong beliefs about capabilities of PwDs negative attitude towards PwDs and wrong perception of the employers towards PwDs. Furthermore, it was noted that employers believe that employing PwDs requires additional

cost. Furthermore, vacancy announcement formats, inaccessibility of building and lack of affirmative action policy contribute to the employment of PwDs.

4.3.3 Working Conditions of PwDs

All participants agree on prevalence of unfavorable working condition, accommodation needs of PwDs are hardly found in the working conditions. There are no pre planned arrangements which exclusively focus to help persons with disabilities.

In totality, the working environment is arranged for non disabled staffs. The physical configuration of working compound, the construction of entrances, stairs, facilities available, office materials and appliances are not conducive for employees with disabilities.

Nonetheless, regarding salary, promotion and opportunities, persons with disabilities GOs and NGOs follow the same procedures with other employees.

4.3.4 Interventions for the improvement the Employability of PwDs

The FGD participants forwarded intervention different strategies to enhance employment opportunities; the government should undertake supervision and follow-ups as to enforce the low to support the employment opportunities of PwDs in NGOs and GOs. Inclusive declaration should oblige institutions to hire and to provide equal opportunities to PwDs, increase awareness rising for the employers using different strategies and modifications of working conditions are explained as major changes to be done. With proclamations, laws and regulations regarding the employment of persons with disabilities, it should be disseminated through different forums to all stakeholders including government officials, the executive bodies, and employers so that they can accordingly discharge their duties, and responsibilities. Furthermore, strict control of discriminations shall be put in place as to check actions of executive bodies towards persons with disabilities on employment and government should take legal measures to avert the problem. Finally, the participants suggested the following specific measures:

- Follow up of the realization of the laws and policies at grass root level
- conducting studies pertaining to the situation of persons with disabilities about employment and employability

- Assist persons with disabilities themselves to know about their rights, so that they should get involved in addressing issues of their own concern
- Higher education institutions shall provide a cross cutting courses about disability to all students to widen awareness and creation of better positive attitude
- Vacancy announcements should address the needs of PwDs and encourage their employment
- Conducting Experience sharing among different organizations

4.4. University Students with Disabilities

About 17.1% of the sampled students' age was within the range of 18-20 years, about 66.9% of the students' age ranged from 22 to 25 years and the remaining 16% fall within 25 & 37 years of age.

As shown on Table 22, the majority of the respondents were students with motor impairments (52.6%) followed by visual impairments (38.8%) and hearing impairments (8.6%).

Table 22. University Students by Type of Disability and Gender

	Sex		
Type of Disability	Male	Female	Total
Hearing	12	1	13
	92.3%	7.7%	8.6%
Visual	33	26	59
	55.9%	44.1%	38.8%
Motor	63	17	80
	78.8%	21.3%	52.6%
Total	108	44	152
	71.1%	28.9%	78.8%
Missing			41

Table 23. Field of Study of University Students with Disabilities

Department	Total	%
1) Accounting and Finance, Management, Marketing	22	15.1%
2) Ethiopian Languages (Afan Oromo, Amharic, Tigrigna)	6	4.1%
3) Ethiopian sign language	2	1.4%
4) Foreign languages & Literature, English, Journalism, Linguistics	3	2.1%
5) Technology (Engineering, Animal Productions and		
Technology, Chemical, Civil, Computer, Information systems,	35	
Petroleum Engineering		24.0%
6) Anthropology	2	1.4%
7) Applied Biology, Chemistry, Mathematics, Physics, and	11	
Statistics	11	7.5%
8) Behavioral Sciences, Psychology, and Curriculum	6	4.1%
9) Civic and Ethical Education	5	3.4%
10) Law	19	13.0%
11) Social Studies (Sociology, Social Work, Political Sciences,	23	4.7.004
Geography, History, Cultural Studies		15.8%
12) Medical Labratory & Nursing	2	1.4%
13) Development studies: Governance and Development Studies;		
Urban and Regional Planning; Wild Life and Econ-Tourism	5	
Management		3.4%
14) Others	5	3.4%

As presented in Table 24, about 81.3% of university students with disabilities responded that the field of study they are studying is their own choice while about 18.7% said the field they study at university was not their choice.

Table 24. Preference of Field of specialization by Disability Type

If this area of specialization	Type of Disability			
(department) your own choice?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	Total
Yes	12	49	61	122
	92.3%	83.1%	78.2%	81.3%
No	1	10	17	28
	7.7%	16.9%	21.8%	18.7%
Total	13	59	78	150
	100.0%	100.0%	100.0	100.0%

4.4.1. Support and Accommodations

Slightly above half of the university students with disabilities or about 54.4% said they got assistive devices and other materials from their universities as it is indicated in Table 25. When this data is disaggregated by disability type, about 62.7%, 61.5% and 46.7% of university students with visual impairment, hearing impairment, and motor impairment respectively said that they received assistive devices and other materials from their universities.

Table 25. University Students with Disabilities by Assistive Devices Received and by Type of Disability

Do students with impairment get	Ty	Type of Disability		Total
assistive devices and other materials from the University?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	
Yes	8	37	35	80
	61.5%	62.7%	46.7%	54.4%
No	5	22	40	67
	38.5%	37.3%	53.3%	45.6%
Total	13	59	75	147
	8.8%	40.0%	51.0%	76.2%
Missing				46

Open ended question was asked to identify the kinds of assistive devices and materials that university students with disabilities received and respondents said that the following were received from their university:

- Audio tape recorder:
 - Walkman tape
 - Cassettes
 - o Batteries
 - Digital recorder
- Monthly payment (pocket money)
- Learning and stationery materials
 - o Books, exercise books and pens
 - o Braille written material, Braille paper
 - o Slate and stylus,
 - o Teaching materials and references

Prosthetics

- Wheelchair
- o Canes
- o Crutches
- o Innersole and rubber tip

Support services

- o Photocopy services
- Internet services
- o Computer service
- Readers
- o Scriber
- o Sign language interpreter
- o Informational support
- o Priority in using cafeteria (no queue for cafe)

Dormitory services

- o Shower service
- o Laundry services (washing machine)
- Training and awareness orientation
 - o Life skills training
 - o Additional training course on computer skills

On the other hand, about 45.6% of the university students with disabilities said they did not get the required assistive devices from their universities.

Accourding to them the following assistive devices are considered important and should be provided by the universities to students with disabilities:

- All hearing aids and other materials
- Artificial pens, crunch, handout copy and laptop, brace wheelchair
- Additional financial support for those who have no supporter, stationery materials, Braille book, slate & styles (writing materia
- Digital recorder
- Assistive technology like computer reader, JAWS
- Rubber tube

- Educational and psychological assistance
- Tape recorder, voice recorder, cassette, battery, woke man, brail written book
- Accessible dormitory and toilet
- Affirmative action
- Information and guidance

Modifications

About 45.3% of the university students with disabilities said that modifications were made for students with disabilities in their university while slightly more than half of the respondents about 54.7% of them said there were no modifications as indicated on Table 26. In terms of the disability types, about 53.8%, 51.9% and 33.9% of the university students with hearing impairment, motor impairment and visual impairment respectively said their university made modifications to make the learning environment conducive for students with disabilities.

Table 26. Modifications for Students with Disabilities in the University by Type of Disability

Are there modifications made for students	fications made for students			
with impairment in your University?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	Total
Yes	7	19	41	67
	53.8%	33.9%	51.9%	45.3%
No	6	37	38	81
	46.2%	66.1%	48.1%	54.7%
Total	13	56	79	148
	8.8%	37.8%	53.4%	76.7%
Missing				45

An interviewee from Adama University has a mixed feeling about the support and the challenge the faced;

The good thing in my stay in the university is the cooperativeness of the Dean of students' Affairs. With his initiative, the university bought me a wheelchair. Yet, the university compound is not good to use a wheelchair, I am not using it. My class mates are very cooperative. Any kinds of decision, it could be about makeup class, exam schedule, or any issue, priority is given to me to decide that helps me feel good. Law teachers are also cooperative and I feel I am not alone. The only difficulty I have is the location of classes. They are far and inaccessible to anyone who has the impairment. Adama university supports me in different ways. Such as access to photocopy free of charge and priority in dormitories and occasionally pocket money.

Another student also reflected his feeling of his stay in the university as follows;

I have a good relationship with my classmates. I am a tolerant person. Whenever bad things are happening, I can control my emotions. However, some teachers are not sensitive to my problem. They teach you where ever they want. There is no specific class location. That creates difficulty in moving here and there. The university environment is full of barriers. Some teachers' teaching skill is in question. Over all the support from the university community is almost negligible.

4.4.2. Challenges

One of the iterviewees from Adama university narrated his own exprience as follows;

Despite my disability I used to play football. But my behavior was not liked by the community. My engagement in football for my own pleasure was discouraged and considered as an act of violating the social norms. Many people including my family, friends and teachers were stating their displeasure of my play. It was morally touching when you hear people saying" You see this crippled playing football, he will be further broken and incapacitated. As an adult person thinking about the past, today, I feel how my society was unkind to me.

The following challenges were also identified by university students with disabilities through open-ended questions.

- Inaccessibility
 - o Buildings and Classrooms
 - o Dangerous pathways
 - o Toilet and Shower
 - Unsafe construction sites
 - o Car parking modes act as barriers
 - Lack of elevators
- Negative attitude of university community towards students with disability
 - o Problem of tape recording the lectures
 - o Unfair evaluation; grading students with disability and others who had access to all materials in the same way is unfair
 - o Teachers negative attitude towards students with impairment
 - o Text books and reference materials not available in Braille
- Inadequate resources for learning
 - o No adequate slate and styles
 - o lack of hearing aid
 - o Inadequate books, reading materials, tape /voice recorders, scanners,
 - o Lack of relevant tutorial support
 - o Inadequate pocket money
 - o Inadequate services on sign language interpreters
 - o Lack of job search skills

- o Inadequate number of computers and digital voice recorders
- o Inadequate guidance and counseling services
- o Lack of transportations services
- o Inadequate number of ramps around dormitory, library, cafeteria and pathways

4.4.3. Hopes and Worries of Employment

Perceived Hopes

About 70.6% of the respondents said that their areas of study prepare them to get the job that they are looking for while about 29.4% of them were not optimist. These patterns were similar across the disability types as shown on Table 27.

Table 27. Perceived adequacy of Area of Study in Prepares Students with Disabilities for Job by Type of Disability

Do you think your area of study prepares	Тур	e of Disab	ility	
you for the job you are looking for?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	Total
Yes	8	40	53	101
	66.7%	70.2%	71.6%	70.6%
No	4	17	21	42
	33.3%	29.8%	28.4%	29.4%
Total	12	57	74	143
	8.4%	39.9%	100.0%	51.7%
Missing				50

Perceived Job Search Skills

From among the university students with disabilities involved in this study, about 62.1% of them said they have the necessary job search skills (see Table 28).

Table 28. Perceived Acquired Job Searching Skills by Type of Disability

Do you think you have the necessary job	Ty	Type of Disability		
search skills?	Hearing	Visual	Motor	Total
Yes	8	29	53	90
	61.5%	50.9%	70.7%	62.1%
No	5	28	22	55
	38.5%	49.1%	29.3%	37.9%
Total	13	57	75	145
	9.0%	39.3%	51.7%	75.1%
Missing				48

5. Challenges, opportunities and reflections on the way forward

In these section highlights of the major challenges, opportunities and reflections identified by the different participants of the study are presented.

5.1 Challenges

- 1) Lack of awareness and negative attitude towards persons with disabilities
- 2) Low awareness about the existing legal provisions and lack of their enforcement
- 3) Inadequate resources for learning, inaccessibility of buildings and classrooms, lack assistance and guidance
- 4) Inadequate preparation on job hunting skills
- 5) Limited access to vacancy announcements, buildings and guidance
- 6) Discrimination and lack of affirmative action in the selection process
- 7) Un-conducive social and physical working environment

5.2 Opportunities

- 1) Emerging support services such the Support Center for Students with disabilities at Addis Ababa University.
- 2) Encouraging admission in higher learning institutions
- 3) Introduction of affirmative action by some employers such as
 - a. Direct assignment and employment by GOs such as Ministry of Education and Ministry of Justice
 - b. Quota system
 - c. Ministry of Civil Service's circular to facilitate the employment of graduates with disabilities in different organizations
- 4) Government offices are more open for employment than Private companies and other organizations
- 5) Positive treatment of co-workers in the working place
- 6) No discrimination in salary scale and promotion
- 7) Perceived employers satisfaction of job performance of graduates with disabilities
- 8) Availability of national and international legal instruments

5.3 Reflections

- 1) Promote the awareness of the society in general and employers in particular.
- 2) Follow-up and enforce the implementation of policies and legal provision in levels of the educational system and employing organizations
- 3) Make information accessible in different formats to graduates with disabilities
- 4) Provide training and guidance for university bound students with disabilities for job hunting and employment

- 5) Introduce affirmative action for the employment of graduates with disabilities
- 6) Create a conductive working environment by modifying, adapting and providing the necessary support to accommodate the needs of employees with disabilities
- 7) Empower the Federation and national association of persons with disabilities so that they can stand and impact on the realization of their right.

6. Conclusion and Recommendation

6.1 Conclusion

This study is the first of its kind in the country, and it focuses on persons with visual, auditory and moor disabilities. Extensive data has been generated from five study sites (Addis Ababa, Adma, Bahirdar, Hawassa and Mekelle). The study participants included were university students with disabilities, graduates with disabilities, employers, and national associations of persons with disabilities. In course of field data collection instruments employed were questionnaire, interview and Focus Group Discussion. Based on the data collected, the state and art of employability of persons with disability was explored, and challenges, opportunities and suggestions for the way forward were obtaining.

Accordingly, employment of persons with disability has come out as a major concern with various challenges for persons with disabilities in general and persons with visual, auditory and motor disabilities in particular. This calls for immediate attention of the Government and other stakeholders. On the other hand, the study showed that there some positive trends that favor the employability of graduates with disabilities. The existing positive initiatives need to be encouraged and scaled-up across the country both in government and non-governmental organizations.

6.2 Major Recommendations

- Launch national awareness raising programs through various media to the general public, policy makers and employers.
- 2). Develop strategies to implement and enforces the national and international legal instruments on education and employment of persons with disabilities.
- 3). Develop guiding manual and provide training for employers about employability of graduate with disability and their working conditions.
- 4). Empower university to prepare, support and training graduating students with disability about the world of work

References

- Aderie Feye (2002). Employment Opportunities and Situations at Work: The Case
 - Of Visually Impaired Women In Addis Ababa. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Addis Ababa University
- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (1995). Federal Negarit Gazeta, Proc. No. 1/1995, Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia. Addis Ababa.
- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2002). Federal Negarit Gazeta, Proc. No.
 - 262/2007. Federal Civil Servants Proclamation. Addis Ababa.
- Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2003). Federal Negarit Gazeta Proc. No.
 - 377/2008, Labor Proclamation. Addis Ababa.
- Feruz Abdurehman (2006). The rights of persons with disabilities regarding employment opportunities. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Addis Ababa University.
- ILO (1998). Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment of Disabled Persons.
 - International Labor Conference 86th session. Geneva.
- ILO (2004). Employment of People with disabilities: The impact of legislation (East Africa):.Geneva.
- Kassahun Yibeltal (2000). Employment situations of persons with disabilities in public and private sector. Bright Hope No.4 Addis Ababa.
- Keralem Ggetaneh (2006). Employment opportunities and challenges of people with visual impairment in the case some selected organizations in Addis Ababa. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Addis Ababa University
- Mindahun Gebretsadik (2007). Employment opportunities of and discrimination against persons with disabilities: The case of the blind and the blind. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Addis Ababa University.
- Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (2009). National Employment Policy and Strategy of Ethiopia. Addis Ababa.
- Ministry of Education [MOE] (2010). Education Sector Development Program IV [ESDP IV]
 - 2010/2011-2014/2015. Ministry of Education. Addis Ababa
- Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (1999) National Program of Action for Rehabilitation of persons with disabilities. Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs. Addis Ababa.
- Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (1996). Developmental Social Welfare Policy.

Addis Ababa.

- Tirussew T. (2005). Disability in Ethiopia: Issues, Insights and Implications. Addis Ababa University Printing Press.
- Wonacott, M.E. (2003). Employment of People with Disabilities. ERIC Digest, ERIC Identifier: ED478950
- Yared Gebreegziabher (2008). Policy and Provsions for Students with disabilities in Higher education: The Ethiopian Case. Unpublished Master's Thesis, University of Olso.
- Zewditu G/Hiwot (2007). Educational and job opportunities for female individuals with hearing impairments in Addis Ababa. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Addis Ababa University.

Anexes

Anex-1: Letter for the participants of the study and Consent Form



Department of Special Needs Education

National Study on the Employability of Persons with Disabilities

Dear Participant;

This project is initiated by Addis Ababa University and University of Vienna of Austria. The purpose of the study is to examine the employability of university graduates with disabilities in the labor market. Furthermore, it tries to identify the challenges and working conditions of persons with disabilities. The data gathered will be analyzed with the aim of improving the employability of graduates with disability and their working conditions which contribute to the quality of life of persons with disabilities in the country.

The study considers the perspectives of university students with disabilities; graduate students with disabilities; chairs of associations of persons with disabilities; heads of student services in the universities; employers (government, nongovernment and private) as well as concerned officials from MOLSA and BOLSA. The investigation will take place in five major cities, that is, Addis Ababa, Adama, Hawassa, Bahirdar and Mekele. The universities in the respective cities will be cover by the study. The participants are university students with disabilities, graduates with disabilities, Chairs, Female Wings of the National Association of Persons with Disabilities, Excusive member of persons with disabilities persons and Employers (GOs, NGOs & Private sectors)

Your are selected to be one of the participants in this study, your participation is on a voluntary basis. You can draw back the given consent at any time. The study is purely professional and in now way affects you personally or institutionally. We assure you that your responses will remain strictly confidential and personal details will be kept anonymous. We therefore, seek your genuine, frank opinion for all questions.

We thank you in advance for your understanding & cooperation!!

Informed consent for participants of the study

On the following paragraphs you find the informed consent. Please tick the boxes that ask whether you agree to participate in our research and if your data can be archived for later use or not

Name		
Anonymous name		
Case	, Case No	
1. I received the information	on leaflet for the above mentioned project.	
A) Yes	B) No	
2. I agree to the condition	of the mentioned interview/FGD/Questionna	ire
A) I Agree	B) I don't agree	
	re will be published. Pictures will be exclusive who are obliged to data protection. The ted works	•
A) I Agree	B) I don't agree	
4. I agree that anonymised	data of me will be achieved for scientific use	3.
A) I Agree	B) I do not agree	
Signature	Date	

Anex-2: Questionnaire 1: University Students with Disabilities (USWDS)

I. Background Information

Put "X" mark in the circle of your choice and respond in writing to those quowith blank space.	estions
1. Sex	
Male	
Female	
2. Age [in years]	
3. Place of birth	
4. Ethnic origin	
5. Mother tongue	
6. Language spoken	
7 Religions	
Orthodox	
Protestant	
Catholic	
Muslim	
Other	
8. Type of impairment	
Hearing	
Visual	
Motor	

Other, specify _____

9. Level of impairment

Total loss	
Partial loss	
10. Severity of impairment	
Mild	
Moderate	
Severe	
11. On-set of impairment	
Before birth	
at birth [present at birth]	
After birth	, if so specify the age
II. University Education	
1. Name of your University:	
2. Your Department:	
3. Year /level:	
4. Year of enrollment	
5. Is this area of specialization [dep	partment] your own choice?
Yes No if no, why	У
6. Do students with impairment ge University?	t assistive devices and other materials from the
Yes No	
If yes, could you list the assistive	e devices and materials?
If No subot posistive devices and	I matarials you think should be seeded of the
students with impairment?	I materials, you think should be provided for

	there modifications made for students with impairment in the University? Yes No Solutions?
If N	o, what modifications you suggest should be in place
8. Ha	y preparation for Job search ve you received supports [orientation/guidance, training, courses] that epare you for job search? Yes No
,,	
i	what was the type of support you received,
i. — — — — ii.	what was the type of support you received, For how long have you received the support?
 ii.	For how long have you received the support?
 ii. iii.	For how long have you received the support? Who provided the support?
ii.	For how long have you received the support? Who provided the support? How do you evaluate the overall nature of the support you received? What do you suggest to be done to improve the overall support for job

ii.	What do you suggest should be done in regard to support for job search for undergraduates students with impairment in the University?
V. Job hunti	ing and aspirations
9. Do	you think you can easily get a job in the area of your study after graduation? Yes No
If No, v	why?
10. Do	you think your area of study prepares you for the job you are looking for? Yes No why?
If I	you think you have the necessary job search skills? Yes No No, what support do you think you want?
	there a place, in the University, where you can go when you need job related formation/guidance?
	Yes No
If	No, what do you suggest to be done?
	there a place outside the university, where you can go when you need job lated information/guidance? Yes No

V. Information on conditions of Graduates with disabilities

14. Do your graduate friends with disability have jobs?

Yes No No If No, why?
If yes, are their jobs in their areas of study? Yes No
15. Are modifications made in the working place to address your friends' needs in place? Yes No No If yes, could you mention the modifications made?
If No, what modifications you think should be in place
16. Are your graduate friends with disability provided with assistive devices and other materials by their employing organization? Yes No Street No Street
If No, do you have any information as to how they are managing the situation?
17. In your opinion, are employments available there for graduates with disabilities? Yes No If No, what do you suggest to be done?
18. Have you heard of any problems that your friends face in relation to employment?

Thank you very much for your contribution!

Put "X" mark in the circle of your choice and respond in writing to those questions

Annex-3: Questionnaire II: Graduate Students with Disabilities (GSWD)

I. Background Information

8. Marital status

Single

with blank space.		
1. Sex Male Female		
2. Age [in years]		
16-20		
21-25		
26-30		
31-35		
36-40		
Above 41		
3. Place of birth		_
4. Ethnic origin		
5. Mother tongue		
6. Language spoken		
7. Religion		
Orthodox		
Protestant		
Catholic		
Muslim		
Other		

Divorced

54

Married	Widowed
9. Type of impairment	
Hearing	
_	
Visual	
Motor	
Other, specify	
10. Level of impairment	
Total loss	
Partial loss	
10. Severity of impairment	
Mild	
Moderate	
Severe	
11. On-set of impairment	
Before birth	
At birth [present a	t birth]
After birth	, if so specify the age
II. University/college Educat	tion
1. Level of education [mentio	n the latest one]
2. When did you join higher e	education and when did you graduate
3. What is your area of study specialization?]	[your areas of studies if you have more than one
4. Was the area of specializat Why?	ion your own choice? Yes O No O if No,

What provisions were there for students with impairment during your University, college education?	/
. Did you receive any orientation/guidance about the world of work during your University/ college education?	
Yes	
If yes, what were the foci orientation/guidance?	
If No , what challenges did you face because of employment related orientation/guidance lack?	
What do you suggest should have been done?	
Do you know an organization that provides employment related guidance/couns for University/college graduates with disabilities?	eling
Yes	
If yes,	
What is the name of the organization	
Have you got support from this organization?	
What were the contents/areas of the support?	
If No, what challenges do you think University/college graduates with disabilitie	 S
face because of employment related orientation/guidance lack?	
What benefits do you think such provisions will have if in place?	

III. Employment History
1. Are you currently employed?
Yes No
If yes, please respond to questions from 2 to 35
If No, go to question to 36
2. How did you get employed?
3. How long did it take you to get employed after graduation?
Less than a year
1-2 year
3-4 year
More than 5 year
if it took you more than a year, what do you think the reasons were?
4. Did you get any support to get employment? Yes No , if yes, could you please mention the supports?
5. What is the type of the organization you are working in?
Governmental
Non-governmental
Own business
Others, specify
6. Total service year
7. Your monthly income
8. (Are you since in married, divorced widowed other specify)
9. Had you tried to get a job in any other institution/organization other than your current employer?

Yes	No
if yes,	
	in how many organizations did you apply?
	in how many did you appear for interview?
	in how many were you not successful?
	what do you think the main factors for your failure were?
10. Is there	e any time that you failed to get a job due to your impairment?
Yes	No No
	what personal measure/s did you take?
	many organizations were you working in before you get employed in your organization?
If more	than two, what were the reasons for leaving your pervious jobs?
 12. Does ye	our current occupation match with your area of study?
Yes	No No
if No , v	why are you working in the area?
	Number to the control of the control
iv. Empic	syment process and opportunities
13. Were	vacancy announcements accessible for you?
Yes	No No
if No,	why?
14. Wha	at modifications/provisions were made for you during the interview process?

15. Did you encounter any kind of discrimination because of your impairment at the time of application or interview?
Yes No If yes, what?
16. Do you think being a person with impairment make employment opportunities more limited? Yes No If yes, why?
17. In your opinion, what measures should be taken by the following bodies in order to improve employment opportunities of university/college graduates with impairment? Government
Employers
V. Working conditions Attitude 18. Do employers treat you like other employees in the organization?
Yes No If No, how do they treat you?
19. Do your colleagues treat you like they treat any other person in organization? Yes No if No, how do they treat you?
20. Do you think your organization community has adequate awareness about the competency of persons with impairment and issues related to disability? Yes No

	If No, could you mention what should be done in that regard?
21.	Do you think your employers are satisfied with your performance? Yes No
	If no, what instances do they mention in regard to your performance?
	Do you want to stay [work for some more time] in this organization? Yes No If No, why is it that you do not want to say in that organization?
VI.	Modifications /provisions around work place
23.	Are there modifications made for you after you are employed in this organization? Yes No
	If yes, could you please mention the modifications?
l [.]	f No, what modification you suggest should be in place for you?
_ 24.	Are there materials/ equipment provided for you by your organization?
	Yes No Service No Service No No Service No S
ļ: -	f No, how are you trying to manage?
_ 25.	Do you have personal assistant?
	Yes No

_	
If	No, why?
II. I	Promotions, further training opportunities and related issues
26. I	Have you got promotion since you are employed in this organization?
	Yes No
27. I ork	Do you get training opportunities when training are there in your area of study and?
	Yes No
I -	f yes , what were the training areas/contents?
- I	f No, why were you denied training opportunities?
- 3. C	yo you get paid the same as your colleagues who have the same qualification? Yes No
_	If No, why?
- 9. D	o you get salary increment and bones as per your performance?
If	Yes No No No, why?
_	
III.	Legislation related
	Are you familiar with legislations on employment of persons with impairment in thiopia?
	Yes No

31. Do yo	u believe employers know legislations related to employment of persons with			
disabi	lities?			
Yes	No No			
If yes	If yes, how do you evaluate the level of implementation?			
If No,	what you suggest should be done in that regard?			
32. Did vo	u try to look for jobs?			
Yes				
	, for how long have you applied for jobs?			
, 55	, i.e., i.e., e.g., e.g. applied i.e. jedet			
why	do you think haven' t you got jobs?			
,	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,			
If No.				
II NO,	If No, why?			
33 In you	r opinion, what measures should be taken by the following bodies in order to			
-	ant unemployed graduates get jobs?			
	Government			
a.	Government			
b.	Employers			
	Associations of persons with disability			
. Economic of persons man also many				

Thank you very much for your contribution!

Annex-4: Interview with Employers

I. Background Information: 1. Type of organization: Non-governmental: Private: Governmental: 2. Your position in the organization: **II: Employment Processes and Procedures** 3. Does your organization employ graduates with disabilities? Yes 4. If yes to the question above, what type of disability are they with? a) Visual b) Hearing c) Motor d) Other (Please specify): -5. Do you know their number? _____ 6. What did the employment process look like? a) Vacancy announcement b) Recommendation c) Other (Please specify) 7. If your answer to question number 3 is no, why? Please tell your reason(s) 8. Does your organization have any regulation to employ persons with disabilities? Yes No 9. If your answer to the above question is yes, what are the provisions and how does it relate to the labor proclamation in Ethiopia? 10. What will your reaction be like if graduates with disabilities come to your organization to look for jobs?

	two job applicants; one with a disability and the other without but with equa
	mpetence and qualification apply for a specific post in your organization, whom would use employ? Please, put your justification for selecting one over the other.
	o you think that your organization's vacancy announcements are accessible in form nd place for persons with disabilities? Yes No III If yes, what type of special consideration do you make?
wi b) c)	oes your organization have any gender priorities in the process of employing persons th disabilities? No priority Priority to males Priority to females
15. ls ˈ wi	Tork Environment there any opportunity your organization might have because of employing persons th disabilities? Yes No xplain
	there any challenge your organization might face because of employing persons with disabilities? Explain.
†	pes your organization have any support system (e.g. special arrangements related to the type and nature of disability) for persons with disabilities employed in your organization?

18. If yes to the question	on above, please list and describe them
19. How do you evalua	te the overall working condition of your organization for persons with
disabilities?	
a. Excellent	e. bad
b. Very good	f. Worse
c. Good	
d. Fair	\exists
20. Are there any i	— ⊓ ncentive packages in your organization (e.g. promotion, caree
development, sala	ry increment etc.) to motivate persons with disabilities in their work
endeavors?	
Yes N	о
If yes to the question	on above, please specify
21. How productive de	you think are persons with disabilities in their areas of expertise?
	
22. What suggestions	do you have about to improve the employment situation of persons
with disabilities?	
23. Is there anything yo	ou would like to say before we wind up the interview?

Thank you very much for your contribution!

Annex-5: Interview I: Interview with University Students with

Disabilities (USWDs)

Part I. Personal Data:
Sex: female male
5. Age: (in years)
6. Place of birth:
7. Ethnic origin:
8. Mother tongue:
9. Languages spoken:
10. Religion/Denomination:
Christian Muslim
Other:
11. Marital status:
Single Married other:
Widowed divorced
12. Number of family members living in household:
13. Indicate the socioeconomic status of your parents
(Specify their education level, occupation and estimated monthly income):
Father:
Mother:
14. What kind of disability do you have?
a) Visual
b) Hearing
c) Motor
d) Other (Please specify):
15. Please indicate the onset and severity of your disability /impairment (immediately before
birth, after birth, late childhood or youth)
·

16.	Please	e specify if any of your family member(s) has/have any disability
17.		d you please tell us about your education or training you got so far (Kindergarten, ry and secondary school, vocational training etc.):
18.	Data 1	related to your University
	18.1.	Name and place of University/College:
	18.2.	Which department is you enrolled in?
	18.3.	How were you placed?
	18.4.	Please specify your field of study:
	18.5.	What year level are you in now?
	18.6.	Was the field of study your primary choice?
19.	Did yo	ou have any job experience so far (internship etc.)? Please specify.
Pa	rt II.	Specific Data:
20.	Would	d you please indicate the situation of your education when you were at primary and
	secon	dary schools, especially the good experiences and the challenges:
21.	Please	e tell us about your motivation to enter a university study program:
22.		d you please indicate the situation of your university education, especially the good tences and the challenges:
23.	How	was your stay in the university in terms of the quality of social and academic life?
24.		kind of support /services do you get from your university (academic, financial, ial, counseling, career guidance, etc)?

25.	Do you for?	a think your current training /field of study prepares you for the job you are looking		
		S why?		
		why not?,		
26.	Do you	a think the nature of your disability affects your job opportunities? Elaborate how, ally by exemplifying your own situation?		
27.	. What employment plans do you have after graduating from the university?			
	Elabor	ate based on the following:		
	27.1.	Do you plan to be hired / employed by organizations?		
	27.2.	Do you have a plan to create a job by yourself and become self-employed?		
28.	Descri	be your expectations about your employment after graduation ?		
	28.1.	Specify what roles you might assume; Elaborate.		
	28.2.	What opportunities do you envisage about your employment after graduation		
		(You might describe if you know any success stories of graduates with disability or role-models)? Elaborate:		
	28.3.	What challenges do you expect about your employment after graduation (You		
		might describe any stories with unjust treatment of graduates with disability)? Elaborate.		
29.	What i	s your view about employers?		
	29.1.	Do you think graduates with disabilities are differentially treated before, during,		
		and after employment (i.e., both positive and negative discrimination)? Describe.		
	29.2.	Describe employers' attitudes in providing equal opportunities for employment of		
		graduates with disabilities compared to others who do not have disabilities. Describe.		
30.		a get any assistance for searching job or employement? If YES, indicate the source of assistance.		

31. Do yo	u know that Ethiopia has ratified the following legal instruments?
31.1.	Are you aware of the Federal Civil Servants Proclamation (517/2007) and other
	related laws? If YES, do you use it to stand up for your employment rights? If
	NO, why
	not?
31.2.	Are you aware of the international conventions that Ethiopia has ratified such as
	the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (2006)? If YES, do you
	use these to stand up for your employment rights? If NO, why not?
32. What	should be done?
32.1.	What should be done by the government, employers, labor organizations etc. to
	facilitate and/or create job opportunities for graduates with disabilities?
32.2.	What should graduate students with disabilities do to increase their employment opportunities?
33. Is ther	re anything you would like to say before we wind up the interview?

Thank you very much for your time and invaluable ideas!

<u>Annex-6: Focus Group Discussion Part I Personal Data: Graduates of Students with Disabilities (GSWDs)</u>

Sex: Female Male
Age: (in years)
Place of birth:
Ethnic origin:
Mother tongue:
Languages spoken:
Religion/Denomination:
Christian Islamic
Other:
Marital status:
Single Divorced
Widowed Living in partnership other:
Number of family members living in household:
Describe the socioeconomic status of your parents (specifies their education level,
occupation and estimated monthly income):
Father:
Mother: What kind of disability do you have?
a) Visual
b) Hearing
c) Motor
d) Other (Please specify):
Education (Kindergarten, primary and secondary school, vocational training etc.):
Name and place of University/college:
Please specify your field of study:
The type and level of degree obtained
Did you have any job experience so far (internship etc.)? Please specify

Focus Group Discussion (FGD) I:

Graduate Students with Disabilities (GSWDs)

FGD Venue	Date
Moderator	Note-taker
Starting Time	End
Time	
Part II Employment experiences	
What are your personal employment	experiences so far?
Do you know employment experience	es of any other graduates with disabilities?
Part III Employment history a) Are you employed or not?	
how easy or difficult it was, ho	or employment experience (who is your employer, ow long it took you, was there special provision by qual hence of employment with non-disabled persons
c) If you are not employed, tell encounters while applying for prospect.	us how long you have been unemployed, your employment thus far, and your future employment

	Status of employability of Graduate Students with Disability in the labor market. a) Do you think persons with disability of similar qualification have equal chance of employment like the non-disabled in the labor market?				
	Do you think there is gender disparity between persons with disabilities? Please explain how that is practiced?				
	How serious do you think is the problem of employability of persons with disability in Ethiopia?				
d)	d) How is their employability if compared to people without disabilities?				
e)	Are there any favorable conditions regarding job opportunities for persons with disabilities in Ethiopia?				
f)	Identify the major factors for the unemployment problem of persons with disabilities in Ethiopia.				

. Impro	oving the employability of persons with disability in the labor market
a) Do	you see any improvement in the employability of persons with disabilities in the
cou	untry in recent years?
_	
b) If	yes, what are the major reasons why there has been an improvement?
_	
c) Wh	nat measures do you think should be taken to improve the situation of the
en	mployment of persons with disabilities in Ethiopia?
_	

Thank you very much for your time and invaluable ideas!!

Annex-7: Focus Group Discussion Part II: Chairs of Federation and Associations of Persons with Disabilities

Personal I	Oata: Graduates o	of Students with Disabilities (GS	WDS)
Sex:	O female	O male	
Age:	years		
Place of b	irth:		
Ethnic orig	gin:		
Mother to	ngue:		
Languages	s spoken:		
Religion/I	Denomination:		
Orthod	lox Pro	otestant Muslim	Other:
Marital st	tatus:		
Sir	ngle	Married	Divorced
Wi	idowed	Living in partnership	other:
Describe to (specify the	he socioeconomi neir education lev	s living in household:ec status of your parents yel, occupation and estimated mo	onthly income):
Motner: _			
What kind	l of disability do	you have?	
,	Visual		
<i>'</i>	Hearing		
<i>'</i>	Motor Other (Please sr	pecify):	
u)	Other (1 lease sp	, cerry).	
Name and	place of Univers	sity/college:	
Please spe	ecify your field of	f study:	
The type a	and level of degr	ee obtained	
FGD Venu	ue	Date	
Moderator	r	Note-taker	

Sta	arting Time End Time
1.	Employment Experiences and Graduates with Disabilities
	Do you know employment experiences of any other graduates with disabilities?
	Yes No
2.	Status of employability of Graduate Students with Disability in the labor market
	a. Do you think persons with disability of similar qualification have equal
	chance of employment like the non-disabled in the labor market?
	b. Do you think there is gender disparity between persons with disabilities? Please
	explain how that is practiced?
	c. How serious do you think is the problem of employability of persons with disability in
	Ethiopia?
	d. How is their employability if compared to people without disabilities?
	e. Are there any favorable conditions regarding job opportunities for persons with
	disabilities in Ethiopia ?
	f. Identify the major factors for the unemployment problem of persons with disabilities
	in Ethiopia.
3.	Working conditions of persons with disabilities
	Do persons with disabilities have a favorable working condition in the work place,
	such as special adaptation, assistance and equal salary and chance for promotion.
	Yes No

	workforce and management
	What improvement do you suggest to facilitate your work?
Ι	Improving the employability of persons with disability in the labor market
	Do you see any improvement in the employability of persons with disabilities in the country in recent years?
	Yes No Seen an improvement?
1	What measures do you think should be taken to improve the situation of the employmen
C	of persons with disabilities in Ethiopia?

Thank you very much for your time and invaluable ideas!!